

IEEE FELLOW COMMITTEE

Society/Technical Council Fellow Evaluating Committee Handbook (December 2019)

THE INSTITUTE OF ELECTRICAL AND ELECTRONICS
ENGINEERS, INC.

3 Park Avenue, 17th Floor
New York, N.Y. 10016-5997, U.S.A.



IEEE Fellow Committee

S/TC Fellow Evaluating Committee Handbook

1. INTRODUCTION	2
1.1 Section Labeling	2
2. GOAL OF THE S/TC-FEC	2
3. CONFLICT OF INTEREST	3
4. RESPONSIBILITIES AND ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS OF S/TC-FECs – VERBATIM FROM THE MANUAL	3
9. RESPONSIBILITIES AND ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS OF THE PARTICIPANTS IN THE FELLOW NOMINATION AND EVALUATION PROCESSES	3
9.5 <i>IEEE S/TC Fellow Evaluating Committees (FECs)</i>	3
9.5.1 <i>Responsibilities of the IEEE Society/Technical Council Presidents</i>	4
9.5.2 <i>Governance Requirements for IEEE S/TC-FECs</i>	4
9.5.3 <i>Term limits of S/TC Members</i>	4
9.5.4 <i>Responsibilities of all S/TC-FEC members</i>	5
9.5.5 <i>Responsibilities of the S/TC-FEC Chairs and Vice-Chairs</i>	5
9.5.5.1 <i>Eligibility requirements</i>	6
9.5.6 <i>Responsibilities of S/TC-FEC Evaluators</i>	6
9.5.6.1 <i>Eligibility requirements</i>	6
5. COLLABORATION BETWEEN THE S/TC-FEC AND OTHER S/TC COMMITTEES	7
5.1 The Role and Limitations of Fellow Search Committees	7
6. TRANSPARENCY REQUIREMENTS (FC 2019)	7
7. APPROVAL PROCESS FOR THE S/TC-FEC FINAL EVALUATION FORMS	8
8. BEST PRACTICES FOR APPOINTING S/TC-FEC MEMBERS	8
9. FURTHER READING	9

1. Introduction

The IEEE Fellow Committee (IEEE FC) Operations Manual (hereafter referred to as “Manual”) contains the main policies for the Fellow Nomination and Evaluation process.

This normative Handbook complements the Manual specifying additional requirements, responsibilities, and recommendations for S/TC-FECs in addition to those already specified in the Manual. This Handbook shall be reviewed at least annually to ensure that the procedures and information given are up to date and shall be posted on the IEEE Fellow webpage. In case of any discrepancy, the Manual takes precedence over this Handbook.

Amendments to this Handbook shall require approval of the Fellow Strategic Planning Subcommittee (FSPS) and the IEEE FC Chair. The IEEE FC and the IEEE Board of Directors (IEEE BoD) shall be notified in a timely fashion of any amendment to this Handbook.

Hereafter, IEEE FC Members (except Chair/Vice-Chair) shall be referred to as “IEEE Judges” and S/TC-FEC members (except the Chair) as “Evaluators.”

1.1 Section Labeling

With the goal of maintaining some history on who and when policies were approved, labels have been added to the end of a Section title followed by the year the decision was made.

The labels are:

1. **“BoD”**: consequence of a resolution of the IEEE BoD or change in higher precedence documents (IEEE Constitution, Bylaws, and Policies)
2. **“FC”**: resolution of the IEEE Fellow Committee
3. **“FSPS”**: resolution of the IEEE Fellow Strategic Planning Subcommittee

If a Section title has no label, then it means that what is specified is a legacy policy inherited from the 2015 Manual or a policy added to align with practices in use up to June 2016.

2. Goal of the S/TC-FEC

As specified in the Manual, the goal of an S/TC-FEC is to provide IEEE Judges with a critical technical evaluation and an assessment of the degree of qualification of Nominees referred to that S/TC by the Nominator. This evaluation shall be performed by the S/TC-FEC by completing an S/TC-FEC Evaluation Form for each referred Nominee and then forwarding it to the IEEE FC. The IEEE Judges shall subsequently score the “Strength of S/TC Support” rating category based on the information contained in the S/TC-FEC Evaluation Form, as specified in the Manual in §17.3.

S/TC Evaluators shall evaluate the Nominee’s contributions, role, and impact according to the same evaluation principles followed by the IEEE Judges, as specified in the Manual in §17.1. Additionally, S/TC Evaluators shall also:

1. Provide a technical assessment only, disregarding any service the Nominee may have provided to the S/TC or IEEE.
2. Treat equally all Nominees referred to them, regardless of whether they are active as volunteers in the S/TC or active elsewhere or not active at all in IEEE or recommended by other S/TC committees.
3. Have no contact with any other S/TC committee on matters related to the Nominees referred to the S/TC and their evaluation, as specified in §5.

3. Conflict of Interest

It is the responsibility of all S/TC-FEC members to determine, for each item of business where they have a vote or decision-making authority, if a real or perceived conflict of interest may exist. The current IEEE Conflict of Interest Policy can be found in [IEEE Policy](#) 9.8.

4. Responsibilities and eligibility requirements of S/TC-FECs – *verbatim* from the Manual

For the convenience of the reader, we report *verbatim* the provisions for S/TC-FECs as specified in the Manual.

***** Start of Manual (Nov. 2019) *****

9. *Responsibilities and eligibility requirements of the participants in the Fellow Nomination and Evaluation Processes*

In accordance with IEEE Bylaw I-305.8, no member of the Board of Directors, the IEEE Fellow Committee (IEEE FC), the Society/Technical Council (S/TC) Fellow Evaluating Committee reviewing the nomination, or the staff shall act as Nominator, Reference, or Endorser for any Fellow Nominee. Additional restrictions to the eligibility of Nominators, References, and Endorsers are specified in Sects. 9.5.5.1 and 9.5.6.1.

Furthermore, in accordance with IEEE Bylaw I-104.2, additional eligibility requirements for Nominees and others involved in the submission and evaluation process, as well as other related procedures, shall also be specified in this Manual. If any, additional eligibility requirements shall be specified in the participants’ sections.

.....
.....
.....

9.5 *IEEE S/TC Fellow Evaluating Committees (FECs)*

Before being evaluated by IEEE Judges, all Nominees shall be evaluated by a Fellow Evaluating Committee (FEC) created by the IEEE Society/Technical Council (S/TC) to which the Nominee was referred to by the Nominator.

The goal of an S/TC-FEC is to provide IEEE Judges with a critical evaluation and assessment of Nominees referred to that S/TC by the Nominator. This evaluation shall be performed by preparing an S/TC-FEC Evaluation Form for each referred Nominee and submitting it to the IEEE Judges. The S/TC-FECs perform an essential role in the Fellow Evaluation process and IEEE Judges rely highly on their evaluations for an objective and technically informed assessment of the Nominee’s credentials.

Since S/TCs may have different practices, it is important to ensure uniformity, reliability, and transparency in how S/TCs perform the tasks requested of them by the IEEE FC. Eligibility requirements for and main responsibilities of S/TC-FECs shall be specified in this Section,

while additional requirements, responsibilities, and recommendations for S/TC-FECs shall be specified in the “IEEE S/TC Fellow Evaluating Committees Handbook.”

For convenience, S/TC-FEC Members that are not Chair/Vice-Chair are also referred to as “Evaluators.”

9.5.1 Responsibilities of the IEEE Society/Technical Council Presidents

By 31 January at 11:59 p.m. US Eastern Time of each year, the S/TC Presidents shall inform the IEEE FC Chair, Vice-Chair, and Fellow Activities Staff of:

1. The name of the S/TC-FEC Chair.
2. The complete roster of the S/TC-FEC.

The date above merely indicates when the information is needed by the IEEE FC. It is strongly recommended that S/TC-FEC members be appointed much earlier than 31 January so that they can decline serving in other roles that may create conflicts or eligibility issues.

The S/TC President shall take the necessary actions to ensure that the S/TC-FEC submits its evaluations by the deadline. The IEEE BoD has passed a motion specifying the following consequences in case an S/TC-FEC fails to submit its evaluations by the deadline:

1. S/TC-FEC evaluations that are not received by the deadline shall not be forwarded for consideration to the IEEE FC.
2. The Nominator, the President of the affected S/TC, its concerned Division Director, and the IEEE Vice-President of Technical Activities shall all be notified.

9.5.2 Governance Requirements for IEEE S/TC-FECs

The following mandatory and recommended requirements shall apply to all S/TC-FECs:

1. An S/TC-FEC shall have a Chair appointed by the AdCom Board of Governors upon recommendation of the President, and may have one or more Vice-Chairs who also shall be appointed by the AdCom Board of Governors upon recommendation of the President.
2. The roster of the S/TC-FEC shall be made publicly available on the S/TC website.
3. The S/TC-FEC should be composed of experts with diverse backgrounds such as research and development, teaching, technical management, engineering application and practice (including product or system design), manufacturing, system operation, product application, etc.
4. The S/TC governing documents shall include the S/TC-FEC Policies and Procedures (or equivalent, such as Handbook or Manual) where at least the following shall be specified:
 - a. The appointment procedure of S/TC-FEC Chair, Vice-Chair (if any) and Evaluators.
 - b. The highlights of the evaluation process followed by the S/TC-FEC
 - c. The fact that the Fellow Manual, Forms, and Handbooks shall take precedence over the S/TC governing documents for matters related to the Fellow nomination and evaluation processes.

9.5.3 Term limits of S/TC Members

The term limits of S/TC-FEC Chairs, Vice-Chairs (if any), and Evaluators shall be based on IEEE Bylaws I-304.4/5/6:

1. Unless otherwise stated, terms are to be intended to be one-year terms.
2. Chairs shall not serve for more than two consecutive terms.
3. Evaluators and Vice-Chairs (if any) shall not serve for more than three consecutive years.
4. Members shall not serve for more than 5 consecutive years, regardless of the position held.
5. Appointment of Evaluators shall be distributed over time so as to avoid the termination of more than about one-third of the members in any calendar year.

For reasons deemed to be in the best interests of the IEEE FC, limitations of tenure may be waived in individual cases with the approval of the IEEE FC Chair and Vice-Chair.

9.5.4 Responsibilities of all S/TC-FEC members

All S/TC-FEC members shall:

1. Abide by the [IEEE Code of Conduct](#) and [IEEE Code of Ethics](#).
2. Be familiar with the Fellow Manual, the FC Handbook on S/TC-FECs, and the S/TC governing documents related to the FEC.
3. Hold all meetings in Executive Session – see the [IEEE Executive Session Documentation and Guidelines](#).
4. Score each Nominee with the minimum number of S/TC Evaluators specified below:
 - a. Five (5), if the S/TC has forty (40) or more Fellows
 - b. Three (3), if the S/TC has fewer than forty (40) Fellows
5. If the S/TC-FEC ascertains that a Nominee has been improperly referred for evaluation to its S/TC, the Chair shall immediately notify the IEEE Fellow Activities Staff and shall provide a recommendation for the appropriate S/TC where to perform the evaluation of that Nominee. Transfers into a new S/TC shall be allowed only if the Chair, Vice-Chair (if any), and Evaluators of the new S/TC-FEC satisfy the eligibility requirements specified in Sect. 9.
6. Complete the S/TC-FEC Evaluation Forms of each assigned Nominee and approve them prior to submission to the IEEE FC (typically, mid-June).
7. Advise the IEEE FC whether the citation proposed by the Nominator is appropriate, providing a revised citation if needed.
8. Destroy all confidential information they may have obtained related to the Fellow nomination process, including electronic correspondence.
9. Treat all data related to the Nomination and Evaluation process as specified by the confidentiality requirements in Section 15.

9.5.5 Responsibilities of the S/TC-FEC Chairs and Vice-Chairs

The S/TC-FEC Chair shall:

1. Attend the orientation courses organized by the Fellow Activities Staff and share with the rest of the S/TC-FEC the orientation material.
2. Be the primary point of contact of the S/TC-FEC with the IEEE Fellow Activities staff.
3. Organize S/TC-FEC meetings, as appropriate.
4. Not perform evaluations nor score Nominees.

5. *Instruct Evaluators of their responsibilities as specified in the Fellow Manual, the IEEE FC Handbook on S/TC-FECs, and the S/TC governing documents related to the FEC.*
6. *Assign S/TC Evaluators to each Nominee, consistently with minimum number of required Evaluators specified in Sect. 9.5.4.*
7. *Submit via the dedicated IEEE Web-Application the S/TC Evaluation Forms for all assigned Nominees as approved by the S/TC-FEC and by the deadline (typically, mid-June) – Evaluators shall be notified upon submission and receive a copy of the submitted evaluations.*

The Vice-Chair(s) (if any) shall assist the Chair in performing his/her duties. One Vice-Chair shall be chosen to act on behalf of the Chair in the event of his/her incapacity. Any Vice-Chair may serve as an S/TC Evaluator and score Nominees. In this case, see also Evaluators' responsibilities in Sect. 9.5.6.

9.5.5.1 Eligibility requirements

The S/TC-FEC Chair (and Vice-Chair(s), if any) shall:

- *Be an active IEEE Fellow.*
- *Be an active member in the relevant Society/Technical Council.*

The following limitations to eligibility shall apply:

- *Shall not serve as a Nominator for any Fellow Nominees.*
- *Shall not serve as References or Endorsers for any Fellow Nominees evaluated by his/her S/TC-FEC.*
- *Shall not be a member of the IEEE FC.*
- *Shall not be a member of the IEEE BoD.*

9.5.6 Responsibilities of S/TC-FEC Evaluators

1. *Complete a Fellow Grade Society/Technical Council Individual Evaluation Form for each of the Nominees he/she is reviewing according to the same evaluation criteria set for IEEE Judges, as specified in Sect. 17.1. Additionally, Evaluators shall not consider the Nominee's outside activities or service to the S/TC.*
2. *Immediately notify the S/TC-FEC Chair if there is any conflict of interest (real or perceived).*

9.5.6.1 Eligibility requirements

An S/TC-FEC Evaluator shall:

- *Be an active IEEE Fellow.*
- *Be an active member in the relevant Society/Technical Council.*

The following limitations to eligibility shall apply:

- *Shall not serve as a Nominator, Reference or an Endorser for any Fellow Nominee evaluated by his/her S/TC-FEC.*
- *Shall not be a member of the IEEE FC.*
- *Shall not be a member of the IEEE BoD.*

***** End of Manual *****

5. Collaboration between the S/TC-FEC and Other S/TC Committees

There shall be neither collaboration nor exchange of any information related to the Nominations referred to a S/TC between the S/TC-FEC and any other committee in its or other S/TCs, such as for example Technical Committees or Fellow Search Committees. Only the S/TC-FEC Members shall have access to Nomination and Endorsement Forms and the information therein shall be kept confidential. No person external to the S/TC-FEC shall receive information on the Nominees or provide input of any kind to the S/TC-FEC (except for the final communication of S/TC Evaluation Forms to the IEEE FC).

If the S/TC-FEC does not have enough expertise to handle the set of Nominees referred to its S/TC, then it implies that the S/TC-FEC may not have been staffed appropriately, the Nominator did not select the most appropriate S/TC, or that a Nominee worked in an esoteric area – which is likely to be a rare occurrence. Should problems arise and additional expertise be needed, additional S/TC Evaluators may be appointed.

5.1 The Role and Limitations of Fellow Search Committees

We define as an S/TC Fellow Search Committee a committee whose charter is to identify/champion Fellow Nominees inside the S/TC. Not all S/TCs have such a committee and some S/TCs may have more than one such committee. Some such S/TC committees may be known by other names (e.g., Fellow Nomination Committee). Some S/TCs may have multiple such committees (e.g., for different technical areas within an S/TC's scope).

Such Fellow Search Committees can be useful to raise awareness of the Fellow program and increase the number of Nominations from the S/TC. However, Fellow Search Committees and S/TC-FECs shall:

- Operate in complete independence as specified in §5. This independence also implies that Nominations championed by the Search Committee shall not be granted preferential treatment as the S/TC-FEC must not even be aware of the Nominations championed by the Search Committee.
- Share no common members.

It is recommended that the Charter or the Policies & Procedures (P&Ps) of any Fellow Search Committees and the S/TC-FEC be included in the S/TC governing documents and that these clearly state that Search Committees and S/TC-FEC shall operate with complete independence from each other.

6. Transparency Requirements (FC 2019)

After all Evaluators have submitted their preliminary assessments for all nominees assigned to them, all FEC members shall be able to see the scores and the narratives of all nominees. This is a mandatory requirement that shall be supported by the scoring software.

A Manual policy currently in force requires that, after the FEC Chair submits final evaluations as approved by the FEC, all evaluators will be sent a link allowing them to see all the final forms submitted by the Chair, including the forms of the nominees they have not evaluated.

The Computer Society FEC shall be granted a three-year exception for the transparency requirements above in order to gradually reduce the size of its FEC down to around thirty

members. By the start of the evaluations for Fellow Class 2024 (March 2023), the Computer Society shall comply with all the transparency requirements like any other S/TC.

7. Approval process for the S/TC-FEC Final Evaluation Forms

The main roles of the S/TC-FEC Chair is to be the primary point of contact between the S/TC-FEC and the IEEE FC and to coordinate the process ensuring transparency, ensuring parliamentary procedures are properly followed, providing guidance to Evaluators, helping Evaluators reach consensus, and meeting deadlines set by the IEEE FC (see also Sect 9.5.5 of the Manual, reported here in §4, for a list of Chair responsibilities). The Chair shall neither perform nor prepare any evaluation and shall not make any decisions related to the evaluation outcome. Vice-Chair(s) and Evaluators shall finalize evaluations.

Once evaluations are finalized, they shall be submitted to the full S/TC-FEC for final approval (simple majority vote required). If there are disagreements among members, the Chair should first help the committee reach consensus but, in case disagreements persist, only a formal vote at a regularly scheduled meeting (in-person or teleconference) can correctly validate the approval of the evaluations. S/TC-FEC Chairs should be aware of this approval requirement (see Manual, §9.5) and should incorporate any additional time for this process into the FEC work schedule accordingly. The deadline set by the FC Chair for submitting all Evaluations is strict and, in the event an S/TC-FEC does not meet it, none of their Evaluations shall be sent to the FC. This will, understandably, not indicate strong support from the S/TC.

After the S/TC-FEC approves the Evaluation Forms, no change to the forms can be made – not even by the Chair or the Vice-Chairs. Once approved by the S/TC-FEC, the Chair shall submit “as is” the Evaluation Forms to the IEEE. After the Chair submits the approved S/TC Evaluation Forms to the IEEE, all Evaluators shall be notified of the submission and receive a copy of the submitted evaluations.

The role of the Chair in helping committee members reach a consensus is very important and, in doing so, the Chair should always be (and be perceived to be) unbiased and not favoring any specific position advocated by members. On the other hand, a Vice-Chair is a regular member (like an Evaluator) and thus can participate in debates and perform evaluations. In the case that a Vice-Chair becomes Chair, then that person assumes all the responsibilities of the Chair – including being barred from performing or preparing evaluations.

If a Conflict-of-Interest arises for the Chair on a specific issue, the Chair’s “gavel” shall be temporarily passed to a Vice-Chair for the discussion of that specific issue. Once that item of discussion is disposed of, then the Chair can resume chairing as usual.

8. Best Practices for Appointing S/TC-FEC Members

S/TC-FEC Members should be chosen as experts to cover most of the fields of interest of the S/TC. Since the S/TC-FEC shall operate in complete isolation from any other committee such as technical Committees (see §5), it is important to staff it in a way that most fields of interest in the S/TC are covered. In addition to covering the fields of interest, it is also important to ensure broad diversity in terms of demographics, for example with respect to factors such as gender, nomination category, employment affiliation type, and geographical distribution.

This diversity in the FEC roster will facilitate the task of assigning a diverse set of evaluators to nominees. Having a diverse set of evaluators contributes to painting a more complete picture of

the nominee compared to the case when the evaluators are homogenous. Furthermore, not all evaluators need to be experts in the field of the nominee, as also “generalists” can comment intelligently on the qualifications of the nominee and the strength of the presented evidence.

It is recommended that S/TC-FEC Members be preferentially chosen among those who have already served as IEEE Judges in the IEEE FC. The S/TC-FEC Chair should preferentially be selected among current Evaluators or Vice-Chair. The experience of having served as an IEEE Judge provides an evaluator with a better understanding of what an IEEE Judge would ideally want to find in an S/TC Evaluation Form. S/TC-FEC Evaluators who are past IEEE Judges can hold orientation or Q&A sessions with the FEC to complement the orientation sessions held by the IEEE FC Chair and Vice-Chair for S/TC-FEC Chairs. These training sessions should be held before the evaluation process starts and should use generic examples and not refer to any specific current or past Nominee.

It is strongly recommended that S/TCs appoint S/TC-FEC members (including the Chair) at least a few months in advance of the deadline – see also §9.5.1 of the Manual which requires that S/TC Presidents inform by January 31st the FC Chair, FC Vice-Chair, and Fellow Activities Staff of the complete roster of the S/TC-FEC including the Chair. This will enable Fellows within the S/TC to know their role during the cycle: Nominator, Endorser, Reference, or S/TC-FEC members. This will avoid the problem of having too few Fellows to serve on the S/TC-FEC because they have already served as Nominator or Reference or Endorsers. Following this recommendation is particularly important for smaller S/TCs as they have fewer Fellows available to serve on the FEC than larger S/TCs.

Nominations (including self-nominations) for serving as an IEEE Judge can be made by following the Nominations and Appointments Committee Guidelines posted here:

http://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/nominations/nominations_guidelines.html

9. Further Reading

For further details on the normative requirements for the IEEE Fellow Nomination and Evaluations process as well as the eligibility requirements of all the participants in the IEEE Fellow process, please see the IEEE Fellow Committee governing documents and Recommendation Guides posted at <http://www.ieee.org/fellows>.